

Top French court nixes ruling on faulty breast implants

October 10 2018



Austrian-born lawyer Sigrid Preissl, who represent women with the PIP implants for Austria, Germany and France, poses in Paris, Wednesday, Oct.10, 2018. France's highest court has overturned an appeals court ruling that required some 1,700 women around the world to pay back compensation they received over rupture-prone breast implants. (AP Photo/Francois Mori)

France's highest court overturned Wednesday an appeals court ruling that would have required some 1,700 women in multiple countries to pay

back compensation they received over rupture-prone breast implants.

The decision by the Court of Cassation means the years long case involving German products-testing company TÜV Rheinland must be retried. The company initially was ordered to pay damages of 5.7 million euros (currently \$6.5 million) to the women.

TÜV Rheinland said in a statement that the company was not at fault and had "performed its mission ... diligently and in total compliance with the applicable regulations." It said it was "serene" about the ruling.

While 1,700 women are directly affected by the decision, the French high court's ruling could have fallout for thousands more seeking damages from TÜV Rheinland in other lawsuits.

The legal drama involves tens of thousands of women from Europe and South America who received the faulty implants, which were made with industrial-grade silicone instead of medical silicone. The scandal helped lead to tougher European [medical device](#) regulations.

The manufacturer of the implants, French company Poly Implant Prothese, or PIP, was convicted of fraud. But the bankrupt manufacturer couldn't pay damages to the women with often painful, leaky implants. They sought compensation from TÜV Rheinland instead, arguing it should have never certified the product in the first place.



Britain's Tracy Kiss, who underwent operation with Poly Implant Prothese breast implants, shows X-rays in Paris, Wednesday, Oct.10, 2018. France's highest court has overturned an appeals court ruling that required some 1,700 women around the world to pay back compensation they received over rupture-prone breast implants. (AP Photo/Francois Mori)

The ruling issued Wednesday overturned a 2015 decision from an [appeals court](#) in Aix-en-Provence that the German company was not liable for the faulty implants and the women had to pay back the damages.

The Court of Cassation concluded otherwise, ruling that "vigilance" is "an obligation." Evidence of potential problems with a medical device means a company like TUV Rheinland "must take all needed measures," including conducting surprise visits to manufacturers.

TUV Rheinland lawyer Cecile Derycke said the [company](#) has paid 5.7 million euros (\$6.5 million) overall to the women involved in the French court case, many of them living in Colombia but also around Europe and elsewhere.



Britain's Tracy Kiss, who underwent operation with Poly Implant Prothese breast implants, answers questions in Paris, Wednesday, Oct.10, 2018. France's highest court has overturned an appeals court ruling that required some 1,700 women around the world to pay back compensation they received over rupture-prone breast implants. (AP Photo/Francois Mori)

Derycke argued that TUV Rheinland was unfairly held responsible for

PIP's wrongdoing.

A lawyer representing [women](#) with the implants, Olivier Aumaitre, warned before the ruling that if no one were held responsible for the defective implants, Europe's consumer product certification system was meaningless.

"We're in a new phase of the process," Aumaitre said after the decision. "Until now, there was a period of doubt." He said the high court clarified what the appeals [court](#) had ignored.



Lawyer Olivier Aumaitre, center, representing thousands of women with the PIP implants, speaks during a press conference in Paris, Wednesday, Oct.10, 2018. France's top court is ruling Wednesday in a case that may require some 1,700 women around the world to pay back compensation they received over rupture-prone breast implants. (AP Photo/Francois Mori)



Britain's Tracy Kiss, who underwent operation with Poly Implant Prothese breast implants, shows X-rays in Paris, Wednesday, Oct.10, 2018. France's highest court has overturned an appeals court ruling that required some 1,700 women around the world to pay back compensation they received over rupture-prone breast implants. (AP Photo/Francois Mori)

© 2018 The Associated Press. All rights reserved.

Citation: Top French court nixes ruling on faulty breast implants (2018, October 10) retrieved 12 July 2023 from <https://medicalxpress.com/news/2018-10-french-court-nixes-faulty-breast.html>

This document is subject to copyright. Apart from any fair dealing for the purpose of private study or research, no part may be reproduced without the written permission. The content is provided for information purposes only.